

Foreword - Mufti Muhammad Khan Qaadri

Today, our society is increasingly becoming stripped and emptied of goodness; piety and the fear of Allah whilst the roots of obscenity and waywardness are becoming entrenched. Satanic forces are busily weakening the teachings of Islam and the commandments of Shariah. Materialism and the apparent glitter of this world have loosened mankind's relationship with his Lord and Prophet. We have now reached a stage where people openly admit that Prayer does not delight them as much as songs! How can one attain delight from Prayer when the heart and mind is contaminated by satanic forces?! Our Creator has clearly stated:

'If anyone turns away from the Dhikr (rememberance) of the Rahman we appoint for him a devil, to be an intimate companion for him' (43:36)

At another stage He describes the state of those

'As for those whose bad deeds are decorated for them, they see them as good'

Whether we admit to it or not, we have, in fact, reached this state. The Hakeem ul Ummah Allaama Iqbal described this state in the following way:

*Whenever I lowered my head in prostration the earth
called out to me
'Your heart is infatuated by idols, what are you to get
from Sajdah?!'*

The cure for such poisoned, eroded and sick hearts is nothing but the Dhikr (rememberance and utterance) of Allah and His Prophet. Until we introduce our hearts to the spring breeze of Dhikr ullah and remembrance of the Prophet it will remain subsumed and gripped in this autumn-like decay.

Allah declares:

‘With the Dhikr of Allah there is tranquility for the hearts’

How fortunate and wonderful are those people of Knowledge and Piety (Ahl ul Ilm and Suffa) who are not only acquainted with the fragrance of this garden but endeavour for others to also become fragrant.

This Ummah should be united in its struggle against waywardness in our society, it should be lovingly reminding people of the forgotten teachings and leading them towards their rightful destination. But, regrettably, rather than striving against evils, we have lined up against each other on issues of Good (Khair) and wastefully employ our resources on unimportant issues. We seem very concerned that raised Dhikr and Durood disturbs the rest and sleep of others but no one seems ready to state that immoral songs and other indecencies should be curtailed.

As for the religious segment, it too has become ensnared in such issues. Should Dhikr be quiet or aloud! Should the Kalima Tayyiba be performed at a particular time or not! Should Durood be recited at a particular time or not! Do we not realise that the one performing Dhikr is reciting the name of his Lord, the one performing durood is but remembering Allah’s beloved. He is not undertaking any evil!

It is opportune here to mention the following act of Ameer ul Mo’mineen Syeduna Ali radhia’Allahu anhu. After reading this we should all examine ourselves closely and realise the extent to which we have become narrow minded and obdurate.

Syeduna Ali radhia’Allahu anhu and his companions arrived to perform Eid Prayer at the plains and found a man there praying Nafil. Syeduna Ali radhia’Allahu anhu took no action. His companions dared not say anything, especially as Syeduna Ali radhia’Allahu anhu had remained silent. After the Eid prayer the companions ask him why he had not prohibited the man praying Nafil as it is neither permitted before or after Eid prayer.

Syeduna Ali radhia'Allahu anhu explained that he was well aware of the ruling and as he was about to prohibit the man he suddenly remembered the verse

‘Have you not seen the one who prohibits the worshiper
when he prays’ (Surah Alaq)

He feared that if he prevented the man praying Nafil he too might become of those who prevent prayer. For this reason he remained silent!

Had our own hearts been engulfed with the love of Allah we would never have involved ourselves in fatwas (rulings) against Dhikr ullah and remembrance of the Prophet. And if ever an excess or deficiency arose we would seek to reestablish equilibrium with great prudence, conscienciousness and wisdom.

When some people in the Indian Subcontinent began issuing fatwas against Dhikr Jahr and other practices of the predecesors Allaama Abdul Haiy Lakhnavi took note and wrote two books in Arabic; one on the permissibility of Dhikr Jahr and the other entitled ‘Akthaar (Abundance) in Ibaadah is not Bidhah’

Due to the efforts of Shaykh Abdul Fataah Abu Gudda these books were recently republished in Damascus.

Translator's Introduction

This is a translation of only two sections of the original Arabic text. These two sections were selected after taking account the needs and aptitude of those who seek knowledge and truth solely through the English medium. It is hoped that these will suffice in consoling and reaffirming pious hearts that Dhikr Jahr is a permissible and authentic act. The other sections of the original work are of a scholastic nature and would only be relevant and of interest to those who would implicitly possess a good command of scholastic Arabic, thus rendering an English translation redundant.

Section 1 is a collection of 48 narrations related to the practice of raised Dhikr and its gatherings.

Section 2 is a detailed response to some of the objections that voiced against raised Dhikr.

Finally there is a brief summary and conclusion of the issues relating to Dhikr.

Muhammad Sajid Younus
London
29 May 2006

SECTION ONE

Evidence for Raised Dhikr

The **First** is from Abu Hurayra narrated by Bukhaari, Muslim, Tirmidhi, Nisai, Ibn Majah and Bayhaqi in Shob ul Imaan

‘The Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’ aalihii wasallam* said ‘Allah proclaims ‘Whatever conjecture My servant has about Me I fulfil it. I am with him when he performs My Dhikr, if he performs My Dhikr within (by) himself I remember him within Myself and if he performs My Dhikr in a group then I remember him in a group better than his. If he extends one hand towards Me I extend a forearm towards him, and if he extends a forearm towards Me I extend an arm towards him, and if he comes towards Me walking I come towards him running’.

Haafiz Abdul Azeem Al Munazri states in *‘Kitaab ut Targheeb wa Tarheeb’* that Imam Ahmad has narrated this hadith with a Sahih Sanad and has added at the end

‘Qataada states that Allah is swift in forgiving.’

Allaama Jazaree in *Miftaah ul Hisn ul Hiseen* states

‘In this hadith is the permissibility of Dhikr Jahr and it refutes those who prevent Dhikr Jahr. The Mutazila have tried to prove from this hadith that angels are better than Prophets, but in truth this hadith offers no such proof because the Prophets have never been part of a Dhikr gathering’

Imam Suyooti states

‘Dhikr in a group or gathering cannot be anything but Jahr, thus this hadith proves it’s permissibility.

The **Second** is the statement of Ibn Abbas narrated by Tirmidhi, Nisai, Ibn Majah, Bazaar, Bayhaqi in Shob ul Iman and Ibn Abi Adduniya in Kitaab ul Dhikr

‘Almighty Allah proclaims ‘O son of Adam, when you remember Me in isolation (alone) I remember you in isolation! And when you remember Me in a group I remember you with a group both better (in virtue) and greater (in number) than which you remembered me’

The **Third** is the statement of Mu’aaz bin Anas narrated by Tibraani

‘Allah states ‘No one performs my Dhikr in Himself except that I perform his Dhikr in a group of angels. And no one performs my Dhikr in a group except that I perform his Dhikr in a more superior group’.

Allaama Munzari states ‘the Sanad (of this Hadith) is Hassan’.

The **Fourth** is the statement of Anas narrated by Imam Ahmad and Bayhaqi in ‘Al Asmaa u wa’l Sifaat’

‘Allah proclaims ‘O son of Adam, if you perform My Dhikr in your self I will remember you in My self and if you perform My Dhikr in a group I will remember you in a better group. If you come towards Me a hand span I will come towards you one arms length’.

The **Fifth** is the statement of Abu Hurayra narrated by Bukhaari, Muslim and Bayhaqi in ‘Al Asmaa’u wa’l Sifaat’

‘Verily there are some Angels of Allah who patrol the paths in search of the Ahl-ul-Dhikr (people of Dhikr),

and when they find a group performing the Dhikr of Allah they proclaim 'Come towards your need (want)!' All the angels gather and cover the group performing Dhikr with their wings that spread to the sky. When the gathering concludes the angels disperse and ascend to the skies where their Lord asks them - although He knows all - 'Where have you come from?' The angels answer 'We have come from a group of people on the Earth who were pronouncing your Tasbeeh, Takbeer and Tahleel'. Allah asks 'Have they seen Me?' The angels answer 'No'. Allah then asks '(What) if they had seen Me?' The angels answer 'If they had seen You they would be most fervent in Your worship, they would be most vehement in proclaiming Your Magnificence and would be most plentiful in pronouncing Your Purity'

Allah then asks 'So what were they asking from me?' The angels reply 'They were asking You for Paradise' Allah asks 'Have they seen Paradise?' The angels reply 'No'. Allah asks 'How would it be had they seen Paradise?' They angels reply 'If they had seen it they would have been more determined in their ambition, more voracious in their demands and even greater in their desire'.

Allah then asks 'What were they seeking shelter from?' The angels reply 'From Hell'. Allah asks 'Have they seen Hell? The angels reply 'No'. Allah asks 'How would it be had they seen Hell?'. The angels reply 'If they had seen it they would have been persistent in fleeing from it. Allah then proclaims 'I make you witness that I have forgiven them.' Then one of the angels (on hearing this) remarks 'A certain person was not part of them, he had come for (another) reason' Allah will reveal to the angels 'Those people are such

that whoever (even) sits with them no longer remains unfortunate’.

And this has been narrated by Ibn Habaan; Tirmidhi; Abu Nuaim in ‘Hilya tul Awliya’ and Imam Ahmad (in Musnad) and others.

The **Sixth** is the statement of Ameer Mu’aawiyah narrated by Ibn Abi Shaiba; Imam Ahmad; Muslim, Tirmidhi and Nisai

‘The Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalifihi wasallam* approached a gathering of his companions and asked ‘For what (reason) are you all seated?’ The companions replied ‘We are seated for the Dhikr of Allah, and we are praising Him for favouring us with the guidance of Islam’. The Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalifihi wasallam* asked ‘With Allah as a Witness, is there a reason other than this for your sitting?’ The companions replied ‘With Allah as our witness, we are sat here for no other reason’. The Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalifihi wasallam* replied ‘I did not ask for an oath to slander you, but (I asked) only because Jibra’eel came to me and informed me that Allah is mentioning you (the gathering) to the angels.’

The **Seventh** is from Abu Saeed Al Khudri narrated by Imam Ahmad; Abu Ya’laa, Ibn Habaan and Bayhaqi that the Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalifihi wasallam* said

‘Allah will proclaim on the day of Qiyaamah ‘Today, the gathering will soon come to know of the Ahl-ul-Karam (people of deed or luck). The Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalifihi wasallam* was asked who were the Ahl-ul-Karam? the Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalifihi wasallam* replied ‘The people of the Dhikr gatherings’.

The **Eighth** is the statement of Anas narrated by Imam Ahmad

‘Whenever Hazrat Abdullah bin Rawaaha would meet a companion of the Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalihii wasallam* he would say ‘Come, let us renew our Imaan in our Lord for a moment’. One day he said this to a man who became angry and came to the Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalihii wasallam* to complain ‘Have you seen Abdullah bin Rahaawa?! He favours momentary Imaan over your perpetual Iman!’ The Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalihii wasallam* replied ‘May Allah have mercy on Ibn Rawaaha, undoubtedly he prefers the gatherings that are a (source of) pride before the angels.

Allaama Munzari in ‘*At Targeeb wa Tarheeb*’ states that it’s Sanad is Hasan.

The **Ninth** is from Hazrat Anas narrated by Abu Ya’laa, Bazaar and Tibraani that the Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalihii wasallam* said

‘No group gathers for the Dhikr of Allah seeking solely His pleasure except that a caller from the sky calls out ‘Arise! You are all forgiven. Your bad deeds have been changed into good.’

Allaama Munzari states that Imam Ahmad has narrated this Hadith with narrators considered Sahih except for (one of them) Maimoon, who for some is Thiqa but Imam Ahmad finds him Daef.

The **Tenth** is from Sahl bin Hanzaliya narrated by Tibraani that the Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalihii wasallam* said
‘No group sits in a gathering in which it performs the Dhikr of Allah, (except that) as soon as they rise

(disperse) they are told ‘Rise! verily Allah has forgiven you’.

The **Eleventh** is the statement of Abdullah bin Mugaffal narrated by Imam Bayhaqi that the Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa'aalifihi wasallam* stated

‘There is no group that gathers for the Dhikr of Allah except that a caller calls out to them from the sky ‘Arise, you are all forgiven.’

The **Twelfth** is the testimony of Abu Hurayra and Hazrat Abu Saeed Khudri narrated by Ahmad; Muslim; Tirmidhi; Ibn Majah; Ibn Abi Shaiba and Bayhaqi that the Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa'aalifihi wasallam* said

‘No group sits to perform the Dhikr of Allah except that Angels encircle them; mercy engulfs them; tranquillity descends unto them and Allah mentions them to those with Him’.

The **Thirteenth** is the statement of the two above mentioned companions (Abu Hurayra and Abu Saeed Khudri) narrated by Ibn Abi Duniya

‘Indeed for the Ahl ul Dhikr (people of Dhikr) are four things; tranquillity descends upon them; mercy engulfs them; angels encircle them and Allah mentions them to the group with Him.’

The **Fourteenth** is from Jaabir narrated by Abd Ibn Humaid, in his Musnad, and Haakim

‘The Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalihii wasallam* said ‘Verily Allah has angels that travel and they descend and stop in the gatherings of Dhikr on the Earth.’

The **Fifteenth** is from Anas narrated by Imam Ahmad and Tirmidhi, who ranked it as Hasan

‘The Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalihii wasallam* ordered ‘When you pass by the garden of Paradise, eat (from it)!’ They asked ‘Yaa Rasoolallah, and what is the garden of Paradise? He replied ‘The circles of Dhikr’.

Allaama Jazaree in *Al Miftaah ul Hisnul Hiseen* writes

‘He (the Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalihii wasallam*) used the imagery of the garden to describe Dhikr and grazing to describe the activity of its participants.’

The **Sixteenth** is the statement of Abu Hurayra narrated by Ibn Najjaar and which Imam Suyooti mentioned in his book ‘*Al habaa’ik fi ahwaal il Malaaiik*’

‘Verily there are angels of Allah that travel in search of the circles of Dhikr. When they come across one they say to one another ‘Sit!’ and when the gathering supplicates the angels say Ameen upon their dua. When they (people of Dhikr) send Salawaat (blessings) upon the Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalihii wasallam* they too send Salawaat until they (the circle) disperse. The angels then say to one another ‘There is good news for them (people of Dhikr), they are not returning (home) except in a state of forgiveness!’.

The **Seventeenth** is the statement of Anas radhiyallahu anhu narrated by the Muhaddith Bazaar

‘Verily from the angels of Allah are those who travel in search of the circles of Dhikr. When they come across such a circle they encircle it and plead ‘Our Lord! We have come to those servants of Yours who glorify Your blessings, recite your Book, send blessings upon Your Prophet and ask You for their Duniya and Akhirah.’ Allah replies ‘Cover them with My mercy, for they are a gathering that sitting no one is wretched’

The **Eighteenth** is the question of Ibn Umar radhiallahu anhu narrated by Imam Ahmad

‘Yaa Rasoolallah, what is the reward of the gatherings of Dhikr?’ The Prophet replied ‘The Paradise’.

Allaama Munzari states ‘Imam Ahmad narrated it with a Hasan sanad’.

The **Nineteenth** is from Jaabir narrated by Abu Ya’laa; Haakim, who ranked it as Sahih and Bayhaqi in ‘Ad da’waat’

‘The Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalihii wasallam* came out to us and said ‘Oh people, verily Allah has angels that travel, they descend upon and stop in the Dhikr gatherings, so you should eat from the gardens of Paradise.’ The people asked ‘What are the gardens of Paradise?’ The Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalihii wasallam* replied ‘The gatherings of Dhikr, so spend your mornings and evenings in the Dhikr of Allah’.

Allaama Munzari states ‘And this is narrated by Ibn Abi Adduniya and others, and in all their chains is Gufra’, the freed slave of Umar bin Abdullah. Both Nisai and Ibn Mu’een deemed him Dhaeef but Imam Ahmad deemed him trustworthy and said *Laa Baas* (there is no issue). The remaining narrators are Hujjah thus this hadith is hasan.

The **Twentieth** is the statement of Ibn Abaas narrated by Tibraani in 'As Saqeer' with a Hasan sanad (chain)

'The Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa'aalihi wasallam* passed by Abdullah bin Rawaaha, who was performing Dhikr with his colleagues, and said 'You are the group with whom Allah has ordered me to stay'. He then recited the verse 'And keep yourself patiently with those who call out to their Lord morning and afternoon' (Surah Kahf v28). So whoever sat with you, the angels sat with him, and if they glorify (perform the tasbeeh of) Allah, the angels also glorify Him and if they Praise Allah, the Angels also Praise Him. The angels then return to Allah - who is aware of it all but - and say 'O our Lord, Your servants were glorifying You, so we glorified You and they were Praising you, so we Praised You'. Allah will say to them 'My Angels, Be witness for I have surely forgiven them'. The angels will say 'Amongst them was such and such (not worthy of forgiveness). Allah will reply 'They (the Ahl -ul-Dhikr) are a group such that no (remains) wretched sits with them'.

The **Twenty First** is the statement of Amr bin A'basa narrated by Tibraani

'I heard the Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa'aalihi wasallam* say 'On Allah's right side - even though both his sides are right - are men who are neither Prophets or martyrs but the brightness of their faces will dazzle the eyes of the onlooker. The Prophets and martyrs will be envious of their station and proximity to Allah. The Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa'aalihi wasallam* was asked 'Yaa Rasoolallah, who are they?' He replied 'They are a collection of people from different tribes who gather together for (no reason but) the Dhikr of Allah and choose the purest

and finest words (for His Dhikr), just as one chooses the finest dates to eat’.

Allaama Munzari states

“the narration of this Hadith is very close to Sahih, there is no harm/objection in it”

The **Twenty Second** is the statement of Abu Darda narrated by Tibraani with a chain which Imam Munzari ranked as Hassan

‘Allah will raise a group of people on the Day of Qiyaamah, in their faces shall be Nur and they will be upon a pulpit of pearls. The people will be envious of them and they will not be of the Prophets or Martyrs’. Abu Darda states ‘(On hearing this) a Bedouin got onto his knees and asked ‘Yaa rasoolallah, describe them to us so we may recognise them’. The Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalihii wasallam* replied ‘They are from diverse tribes and different towns who love each other solely for Allah and gather for the Dhikr of Allah and perform His Dhikr’.

The **Twenty Third** is the statement of Abu Saeed Khudri narrated by Imam Haakim; Bayhaqi; Ibn Habbaan; Imam Ahmad; Ya’laa and Ibn Sunni

‘The Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalihii wasallam* said ‘Increase the Dhikr of Allah until the people say (about you) ‘Surely he is mad’

The **Twenty Fourth** is from Ibn Abbaas narated by Tibraani

‘The Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalihii wasallam* said ‘Perform the Dhikr of Allah (to an extent) until the hypocrites claim that surely you are only pretending.’

Imam Suyooti states in '*Nateeja' tul Fikr Fil Jahr bi'l Dhikr*'

'It is inferred from these two Ahadith (No. 23 & 24) that these effects could only manifest from Dhikr Jahr, not Quiet Dhikr'.

The **Twenty Fifth** is the statement narrated by Bayhaqi in Sho'b ul Imaan

'Increase the Dhikr of Allah until the hypocrites claim 'Surely they are only pretending'.

The **Twenty Sixth** is the statement of Abdullah bin Umar narrated by Baqiyy bin Makhlad

'Verily the Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa'aalifihi wasallam* passed by two gatherings; one of whom was calling out to Allah and seeking His pleasure whilst the other gathering was studying knowledge. The Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa'aalifihi wasallam* said 'Both these gatherings are Khair (good) but one of them is better than the other.'

The **Twenty Seventh** is from Ibn Masood narrated by Imam Ibn Mubaarak; Saeed bin Mansur; Ibn Abi Shayba; Imam Ahmad in 'Zuhd'; Ibn Abi Haathim; Abul Shaykh in 'Kitaabul Uzma'; Tibraani in 'Kabeer' and Bayhaqi in 'Shob ul Iman'

'Verily one mountain calls the other by its name and asks 'Oh so and so, has anyone passed by you today who performed the Dhikr of Allah?' And if the mountain replies yes, it is very happy. Abdullah (Ibn Masood) then recited this verse 'Indeed ye have put forth a thing most monstrous. At it the skies are about

to burst, the earth to split asunder, and the mountains to fall down in utter ruin' (Surah Maryam v89/90)

The **Twenty Eighth** is from Muhammad bin Munkadir narrated by the Muhaddith Abul Shaykh in his book 'Al Uzma'

'It has reached me about two mountains that in the morning one of them calls the other by its name and asks 'Oh so and so, has a Dhaakir (one who performs Dhikr) of Allah Almighty passed by you today?' The second Mountain replies 'Yes'. The first mountain then comments 'Verily Allah has cooled your eyes with it, no Dhaakir has passed by me today.'

The **Twenty Ninth** is narrated about Ibn Abbas that he said in explanation of the verse 'And the heavens and the Earth wept for them not' (Surah Dhukhaan v29)

'Verily when the believer dies the piece of land upon which he prayed and performed the Dhikr of Allah cries for him.'

Ibn Jareer mentioned this Hadith in his tafseer.

The **Thirteenth** is from Abu Ubayd, the companion of Sulaymaan Bin Abdul Malik, narrated by the Muhaddith Ibn Abi Duniya,

'When a believing servant dies parts of the earth call out 'A believing servant of Allah has died'. Upon this the earth and the sky both cry. The Most Merciful asks 'Why are both of you crying?' They both reply 'Oh our Lord, He never walked on any part of us except performing Your Dhikr.'

Imam Suyooti states it is evident that the crying of the earth and mountains for the Dhikr could not be except with Dhikr Jahr.

The **Thirty First** is narrated by Imam Bayhaqi from Zaid bin Aslam who narrates from a companion who said

‘I went out with the Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalihii wasallam* one night and passed a man in the Mosque performing Dhikr in a raised voice. I asked ‘Yaa Rasoolallah, is it possible that he is one who pretends?’ The Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalihii wasallam* replied ‘No, he is humble.’

The **Thirty Second** is from Uqba narrated by Imam Bayhaqi

‘There was a man called Dhul Bijaadain about whom the Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalihii wasallam* said ‘Verily he is humble’ and that was because he would perform the Dhikr of Allah.’

The **Thirty Third** is from Hazrat Jaabir narrated by Imam Bayhaqi

‘A man would raise his voice in Dhikr and another man asked him to keep his voice lowered. The Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalihii wasallam* ordered ‘Leave him (let him be), for verily he is humble’

The **Thirty Fourth** is from Shaddaad bin Aos narrated by Imam Haakim

‘We were with the Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalihii wasallam* and he ordered ‘Raise your hands and say ‘Laa ilaaha illallahu’. We did so. The Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalihii wasallam* then said ‘Oh Allah, verily You sent me with

these words, and You ordered me with them, and You promised me upon them, undoubtedly You do not renege on your promises.'

The **Thirty Fifth** is from Abdur Rahmaan bin Sahl narrated by Ibn Jareer and Tibraani

'When the verse 'And keep yourself patiently with those who call out to their Lord morning and afternoon' (Surah Kahf v28) was revealed the Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa'aalihii wasallam* was in one of his houses. He came out and found a group performing the Dhikr of Allah and sat with them and declared 'All praise to Allah who has ordered that I stay with them.'

The **Thirty Sixth** is from Thaabit narrated by Imam Ahmad bin Hanbal in his book 'Az Zuhd'

'Salmaan radhiallaahu anhu was with a group performing the Dhikr of Allah, the Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa'aalihii wasallam* passed by and they stopped. The Prophet said 'Verily I saw mercy descending upon you and desired to share in it with you.'

The **Thirty Seventh** is from Abu Razeen Al'Uqailee narrated by Imam Asbahaanee in the book 'At Targeeb wa Tarheeb'

'The Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa'aalihii wasallam* verily said 'Shall I tell you around what all matters revolve?' They replied 'Certainly' The Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa'aalihii wasallam* said 'Make the gatherings of Dhikr compulsory upon yourselves! and when you are alone move your tongue with the Dhikr of Allah!'

The **Thirty Eighth** is the statement of Anas narrated by Bayhaqi and Asbahaanee

‘If I was to sit with the group performing the Dhikr of Allah after the morning prayer until sunrise, it would be more beloved to me than everything upon which the Sun rises (i.e the world). And if I was to sit with the group performing the Dhikr of Allah after Asr until the Sun disappears it would be more beloved to me than the world and everything in it’

The **Thirty Ninth** is the statement of Anas narrated by Abu Daud and Abu Ya’laa

‘If I was to sit with the group performing Dhikr (after morning prayer) until sun rise, it would be more beloved to me than freeing four slaves from the descendants of Sayyidina Ismail *alaihi salaam*. And if I was to sit with the group performing Dhikr of Allah after Asr prayer until the setting of the Sun it would be more beloved than freeing four slaves.’

The **Fortieth** is from Amar bin Dinaar narrated by Bukhaari and Muslim with their respective chains ‘Abu Ma’bad, the truthful freed slave of Ibn Abbaas, informed me that his master (Ibn Abbaas) said

‘Verily people would raise their voices in Dhikr after finishing from Fard prayers, just as in the time of the Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalihii wasallam*.’

With their same respective chains Bukhaari & Muslim narrate from Ibn Abbas who said

‘I would become aware of the Prophet’s *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalihii wasallam* prayer finishing with the Takbeer.’

The **Fourty First** is the statement of Umar narrated by Imam Haakim

‘Whosoever entered the market and proclaimed ‘Laa ilaahu ilallaahu wahda hu laa shareeka Lahu, Lahulmulku, wa lahul hamdu, Yuhyi wa yumee, bi yadhi khair, wa huwa ala kulli shayin Qadeer’ *None is worthy of worship but He, He is One and has no partner, kingdom is for Him and praise is also for Him, He gives life and He gives death, with Him is all good and He has power over all Allah will record for him a thousand rewards.’*

In some chains it is ‘and he calls out’.

The **Fourty Second** is from the Muhadith Saeed bin Mansur from Ubaid bin Umayr from Umar Farooq; and from Abu Ubayd with a different chain from Umar and from Bayhaqi from Umar; and Bukhaari from Umar

‘He (Syedina Umar) would proclaim several Takbeers from his dome in Mina, on hearing which the people in the Mosque would also proclaim Takbeer and then all those in the markets would proclaim Takbeer until the whole of Mina was proclaiming Takbeer.’

These are the Sahih ahadith, which like other similar Ahadith, both explicitly and inexplicitly make clear that Dhikr Jahr is not disliked. Indeed these ahadith either prove it’s permissible or Mustahab status. And why not!?! Dhikr Jahr causes hearts to soften and tender in a way Quiet Dhikr cannot.

Yes, Jahr that exceeds limits (screaming) is prohibited by Shariah and so too is normal Jahr impermissible (only) when it disturbs those sleeping or praying, or if there is suspicion of show, or if illegal acts take place, or when it becomes

considered as Fard and necessary like the obligations (of religion). (This is because) Many things are permissible but not obligatory but if they are deemed necessary or are general and are made specific, they become Makruh. This has been explained by Allaama Ali Al Qaari in Shara Mishkaat; Allaama Haskafiyy in ‘Dur ul Mukhtaar’ and other scholars.

And do not ever think that the permissibility of Dhikr Jahr is contrary to the Ijma of the Hanafees. The assertion that their Ijma prohibits Dhikr Jahr is false for verily as mentioned previously Allaama Bazaari has described it permissible in his fataawa.

And as for what Sayyid Hammawi has claimed in ‘*Hawaashi (footnotes) Ashbaa*’ that the statement of Allaama Bazaari is contradictory because on one occasion he describes it haraam and on another he describes it permissible. This claim is not correct because Bazaari has himself declared Jahr permissible and has only mentioned its illegality by way of a quote from Fatawa Qadhi. Thus there is no contradiction.

Amongst the muta’akhireen scholars who consider Jahr permissible is the renowned Allaama Khair udin Ramlee who, as mentioned before, termed it legal in his fataawa. And from them is Shaykh Abdul Haque Ad Dehlvi who in his persian risaala entitled ‘*BiTowseel Al Mureed ilal Muraad, Byaan ahkaam alAhzaab wal Oraad*’ has discussed it’s permissibility at great length.

‘Jahr and open, in Dhikr and recitation, and the gathering for Dhikr in circles and Mosques is permissible and legal. This is based on the hadith ‘Whoever remembers Me in a group, I remember him in a group better than it’. And the statement of Allah ‘Remember Allah as you remember your forefathers or with a far greater remembrance (Surah Baqarah v200)’ is also possibly

proof of Dhikr Jahr. And in Sahih Bukhaari is a narration from Ibn Abbas

‘In the time of the Prophet we would not know of people finishing their prayers except through Dhikr Jahr’.

In the Sahih (of Bukhaari & Mulim) it is stated *‘they would recite aloud ‘Laa ilaahu illallaahu wahda hu laa shareeka Lahu, Lahulmulku, wa la hul hamd, wa huwa ala kulli shayin Qadeer’*. It is in some narrations that this was specifically recited with Fajr and Maghrib prayers.

The Prohibition in the the Prophet’s statement *‘Oh people give peace to yourselves, you are not addressing a deaf or absent’* was not because Jahr was contrary to Shariah but was for reasons of convenience and ease.

It is proven many times that the Prophet raised his voice in Dhikr & Dua and the Aslaaf have followed this. (For example) it is in Sahih Bukhaari

‘When the companions were busy digging the trench they were experiencing great hunger. The Prophet saw their state and said ‘Oh Allah, there is no life but the life of Akhirah, forgive the Ansaar and Muhaajireen’ To this the companions replied

**We are those who have pledged to Muhammad
To keep striving (Jihaad) for as long as we remain’**

In short there is no disagreement over Dhikr Jahr in specific times and places, thus our discussion centres around the question of whether or not a commandment for a specific place or occasion can prove the generality of the commandment. Those against Dhikr Jahr may argue that there could be

benefits of Dhikr Jahr in specific occasions that do not translate into other occasions. Alternatively, they could state that Jahr is only permissible when Dua and Dhikr are combined, and not permissible when Dua and Dhikr are performed separately. It is thus necessary to quote evidence that prove the permissibility is general.

To gather solely for Dhikr is proven from an agreed (Sahih Bukhaari and Muslim) hadith narrated by Abu Hurayra ‘Some of Allahs angels circle the paths in search of circles of Dhikr’. In another narration it is ‘A group of Muslims does not sit in a gathering of Dhikr except angels encircle them, tranquillity descends upon them and mercy subsumes them.’ (narrated by Muslim).

And to state that (the term) Dhikr (in these narrations) refers only to scholastic debates or only the remembrance of Allah's blessings is far (from the truth) because it is not permissible to restrict the definition of a word to something not immediately obvious (one that does not quickly spring to mind when that word is mentioned).

It also cannot be claimed that the gathering of people for Dhikr does not prove the Dhikr will be Jahr because each one could individually perform quiet Dhikr on his own. This (claim) is invalid because if the Dhikr is quiet, what is the point of gathering?!

And as for the permissibility of gathering solely for Dua, it is proven from the hadith narrated by Imaam Haakim, which (it's sanad) is in accordance with the conditions of Imam Muslim

‘No group gathers, (in which) some of them make dua and some of them say Ameen, except that Allah accepts their dua’.

And as for gathering to recite the Quran, it is proven from the hadith

‘A group does not gather in any of Allah’s houses and recites the Quran and teaches it except that angels encircle it’.

Imam Nawawi and others have ranked it as Sahih. (It is in Sahih Muslim)

On the basis of such ahadith the Ulama have permitted the reading of A’hzab and Ao’raad in Mosques and congregations.

Shaykh Abdul Haque Muhaddith Dehlvi in ‘*Shar ul Mishkaat*’ states in explaining the hadith of Abu ibn Ka’b

‘When the Prophet would finish praying Witr he would recite ‘Subhaan alMalikil Qudoos’ thrice, and raise his voice with the third’

This has been narrated by Abu Dawud, Nisai, Ibn Abi Shayba; Ahmad and Daar Qutni amongst others. This is the **Forty Third** proof in the permissibility of Jahr.

This hadith proves that Dhikr Jahr is lawful and without doubt proven from Shariah! However quiet Dhikr is better. In Mirqaat, Ali Qaari, in the explanation of this same hadith, quotes (the commentator) Muzhir

‘This proves that, when there is no fear of pretence, Dhikr Jahr is not just lawful but is Mustahab, because it promotes the Deen, educates the listeners and awakens the neglectful; (with Dhikr Jahr) the barakah of the Dhikr extends to where the sound reaches and trees, animals and the environment are blessed with barakah. It induces others

to follow this good act and every green and dry thing bears witness to it (the performance of Dhikr). Some Mashaaikh have preferred quiet Dhikr for it is far from pretence but this is dependent upon Niyyah (intention).'

It is well known that it was the norm of Mulla Ali Qaari in all his writings to necessarily refute a view he opposed. Thus remaining silent on this quote of Muzhir whilst not refuting Dhikr Jahr is proof that he too was convinced of its permissibility. (In addition) The tendency of some of his passages in the Shar of Hisn ul Hiseen points towards this, even though on some occasions his other writings refute it.

The **Fourty Fourth** proof of permissibility is that mentioned by the author of of As Siyar and the author of 'As seerat Ashaamiyya' and 'Muwaahib udDuniya' and other authors from Ibn Sa'd about the assassination of Ka'b bin Ashraf (the blasphemer of the Prophet) by Muhamad bin Maslama and his companions.

'On their return after killing him, they reached Baqeeh al Garqad (Jannat ul Baqeeh) where they all proclaimed Takbeer aloud. The Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa'aalihil wasallam* was standing that night and praying. When he heard their Takbeer he too proclaimed Takbeer and came to know that they had killed him'.

The **Fourty Fifth** is from Ibn Jaabir narrated by Abu Nuaim in '*Hilya t'ul Awliya*'

'Abu Muslim Alkholaani would regularly proclaim Takbeer aloud and would often allow his children to join in and would state 'Perform Allah's Dhikr until the Jaahil (ignorant) reckon you are mad'.

The **Fourty Sixth** is from Abu Yunus narrated by Abu Nuaim

‘One day Abu Hurayra led the people in prayer, after performing salaam he raised his voice and proclaimed ‘All Praise is for Allah who has made deen the means of Qiyaam and made Abu Hurayra an Imaam when he is but only a servant.’

The **Fourty Seventh** is narrated from Mudaarib by Abu Nuaim

‘I was travelling at night when (I heard) a man proclaiming Takbeer. I took my camel up to him and asked ‘Who is this proclaiming Takbeer?’ He replied ‘I am Abu Hurayra’. I asked ‘What are these takbeers (for)?’ He replied ‘In gratitude (to Allah)’.

The **Fourty Eighth** is the story of Hazrat Umar’s bringing of Islam narrated by Bazaar, Tibraani; Abu Nuaim in Hilya; Bayhaqi in Ad Dalaail; Abu Nuaim in Ad Dalaail and Ibn Asaakir.

‘When he came to the Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalihi wasallam*, who was with his companions in Dar ul Arqam, he proclaimed ‘I testify there is none worthy of worship but Allah and verily you are Allahs Prophet.’ The people in the Dar ul Arqam proclaimed the takbeer and it was heard by the people in Masjid-ul-Haraam’.

SECTION TWO

Objections to Raised Dhikr

It is stated in Fatawa Khairiya that Shaykh Ibrahim of Damascus was asked about the gatherings organised by the Sufiya, such as the circles of Dhikr in Mosques, that have been passed down through the generations in which Sufiya Qasaaid (poetry) were recited. Some object and claim the reciting of poetry and performing of Dhikr Jahr is impermissible. Are these complaints in accordance with Shariah?

The response of Shaykh Ibrahim of Damascus:

The hadith contain commands that require the activities of Dhikr circles, Dhikr Jahr and reciting of Qasaaid! For example (the statement of Allah) *'If one performs My Dhikr in a group then I will perform his Dhikr in a better group'*. This hadith ul Qudsi is narrated by Bukhaari, Muslim, Tirmidhi, Nisai, Ibn Majah and Imam Ahmad with Sahih chains of narration. It is obvious that Dhikr in a group cannot be anything but Jahr. Similarly the Angel's participation in Dhikr gatherings is also mentioned in Hadith There are many Ahadith narrated regarding this subject.

Indeed there are those ahadith which call for silent Dhikr. We (must) reconcile these two types of Ahadith (in a way such that we act upon both and do not disregard any one of them); the reason for these two types of ahadith are differing personalities and circumstances, just as there are hadith demanding quiet recitation of the Quran there are also hadith demanding Jahri recitation of the Quran (the two types of Ahadith on this matter are also explained in terms of differing personalities and circumstances).

This (practice of Dhikr Jahr) is not contrary to the hadith '*Quiet Dhikr is better*' because quiet Dhikr is better where there is a possibility of pretence or disturbing those praying or sleeping. (However) Some of the Ahl ul Ilm (People of Knowledge) have stated that where such circumstances do not prevail Dhikr Jahr is better because, for one, those listening to it benefit and, secondly, it (Dhikr Jahr) arouses the heart of the Dhaakir.

With regards to the verse '**Remember your lord in yourself**', this is Makki, just like the verse commanding the silent recitation of the Quran. This verse was revealed at a time when the purpose was to ensure the Mushrikeen would not hear the recitation and would not swear at the Quran and the One who revealed it. Because such circumstances no longer exist Dhikr Jahr is permissible.

Some of Imam Maalik's teachers and Ibn Jareer etc state that this verse means that Dhikr Jahr should not be performed out of respect when the Quran is being recited. This is proven by the fact that connected to this verse are the words '**So when the Qur'an is recited, listen to it.**'

(Further) the great Sufiyaa have stated the commandment (of Quiet Dhikr) in this verse is specific to the Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa'aalihii wasallam*. All others, apart from the Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa'aalihii wasallam*, are subject to evil (waswasa) and worldly thoughts. Thus Dhikr Jahr is better for them for it is more effective in ridding such thoughts. This statement is supported by the hadith related by Allaama Bazaar '*Whoever from you prays at night should recite aloud because the angels will pray with you and listen to your recitation*'.

And as for the tafseer (interpretation) that excess in the verse **‘Allah does not like those who exceed’** refers to Jahr, this interpretation is rejected. Because the well established and accepted tafseer (of the words) is that the commandment should not be exceeded. It is necessary to reconcile the (different) Ahadith about Quiet and Jahr Dhikr in the way mentioned above.

We will (now) present those pieces of evidence that are used to prohibit Dhikr Jahr. Alongside them we will present a defence of Dhikr Jahr.

Objection No 1

Allah states ‘And remember your Lord by your tongue and within yourself, humbly and with fear and without loudness in words, in the mornings and the afternoons’.
(Surah A’raaf verse 250)

This verse proves that the Dhikr of Allah should be performed quietly, thus evidently Dhikr Jahr is forbidden except in cases where the scriptures have allowed it.

This objection can be answered in several ways:

1) The Sufiyaa have answered this in a way that is apparent to them but which we are unable to understand. (They state) that this commandment is specific to the Prophet *sallallaahu alaihi wa’aalihil wasallam* it does not apply to anyone else.

2) This command is neither Fard nor Wajib and thus cannot condemn its opposite to being Haraam or Makruh. Rather it is an instructive command.

(i.e. It does not mean that we are compelled to do it. There are many other such instances in the Quran - for example after completing Hajj we are instructed to Hunt. This does not mean that Hunting after Hajj is compulsory, it merely indicates that hunting is now, after completing Hajj, permissible. Similarly the commandment here is one of permissibility, not compulsion.)

3) This verse is only an instruction for the one listening to the Quran, for the adjoining verse states **‘So when the Qur’an is recited, listen to it, and be silent that you may receive mercy’**. This means that the person listening to the Quran should perform the Dhikr of Allah quietly and within himself with humility. This is what Ibn Jareer and Abu’l Shaykh whilst quoting from Ibn Zaid have written

‘Imam Suyooti in his book Nateeja-tul-Fikr states that with the commandment to remain silent (whilst the Quran was being recited) it was feared that people may, through laziness, stop performing Dhikr altogether and become Gaafil (neglectful) of the Dhikr of Allah. Consequently, the verse ends with the words ‘Be not of those who are neglectful’.

Thus this verse was not revealed to prohibit Dhikr Jahr.

4) This verse, rather than prohibiting, is (in fact) evidence in support of Jahr that is not excessive. Imam Raazi in his Tafseer states that the phrase **‘Remember your Lord within yourself’** provides instruction to perform Dhikr quietly and discretely whilst the phrase **‘without loudness’** instructs that it should not be excessively loud. Thus when the whole verse is considered in its entirety it means that Dhikr should be in a way that is between quiet and excessively loud. This principle is also mentioned by Allah Ta’aala in another place in the

Quran **‘And offer your Salat neither aloud nor in a low voice, but follow a way between** (Surah Asraa v110).’
Thus the above verse proves both types of Dhikr - Jahr and quiet. The virtue of quiet Dhikr is that it is humble and discrete.

Objection No 2 :

For those who prohibit Dhikr Jahr this is the strongest piece of evidence.

Ibn Abi Shayba; Ahmad ibn Hanbal, Ibn Mardwiya and Imam Bayhaqi in ‘Al asma’u wal sifaat’ narrate from Abu Musa Al Ashari

‘We were with the Prophet on a Jihaad. We would not descend into a valley or ascend from it to a high place without proclaiming Takbeer aloud. The Prophet came to us and said ‘O people! Give yourselves peace for you are not calling out to the deaf or absent, you are calling out to None but The Samee’ (All hearer) and Baseer (All Seer). Verily you are calling He who is closer to you than your own necks.’

This hadith is also mentioned in the 6 sahih books.

(Further) Imam Tirmidhi in the chapter entitled ‘Fadl ul Tasbeeh’ of his book ‘Ad dawaat’ narrates from Muhammad bin Bashaar from Marhoom bin Abdul Aziz Attaar that Abu Na’aama Sa’di narrated from Abu Uthmaan Nahdi that Abu Musa Al Ashari said

‘We were with the Prophet in a battle. When we were returning and Madeenah came into view the people proclaimed the takbeer, and in this they raised their voice. The Prophet said ‘Verily your Lord is neither deaf nor absent. He is amongst you and (as close as being)

between you and the heads of your horses'. The Prophet then said Oh Abdullah bin Qais (Abu Musa Al Ashari's name) Shall I not tell you about one of the treasures of paradise and recited 'La Hola wa laa quwata illa billah'.

Imam Tirmidhi states 'This hadith is sahih. The name of An Nahdi is Abd ur Rehmaan and the name of Abu Na'aama is Amr bin Isa' and 'He is between you' refers to His Knowledge and Ability'.

Imam Muslim in his chapter '*To keep the voice low in Dhikr is Mustahab*' of his '*Book of Dhikr*' states with the narration delivered to him by Muhammad bin Fudayl and Abu Muaawiya from Asim from Abu Uthman from Abu Musa who said

'We were with the Prophet on a journey, people began proclaiming Takbeer aloud. The Prophet said 'People! give yourselves rest and peace. You are not calling a deaf or absent. You are calling the Samee and Qareeb and He is with you'. Abu Musa states 'I was behind the Prophet and reciting 'La Hola wa la quwwa ta illah billah' The Prophet said 'Oh Abdullah, shall I not tell you of one of the treasures of paradise. I said 'Indeed' The Prophet said 'La hola wala quwwa ta illah billah'.

A similar hadith is also narrated with the narration of Ibn Numayr and Is'haaq bin Ibrahim and Abu Saeed As Shajj from Hafs bin Giyaath from Aasim.

The third narration is as follows; Abu Kaamil Fudayl bin Husayn from Yazeed bin Zuray from Taymiyy from Abu Uthman from Abu Musa

'They were with the Prophet ascending from a valley. When a man would reach a high place he would proclaim

'Laa ilaaha illallah wallaahu akbar' loudly. (On hearing this) the Prophet said 'You are not calling One who is deaf or absent'.

Is'haq bin Ibraheem from Thaqafee from Khalid AlKhazza from Abu Uthman who narrates *'We were with the Prophet in a battle ..'* and he mentioned this hadith and added the words *'And He you are calling is closer to each one of you than the necks of the animals you ride'*.

Imam Nawawi in the *'Shar (commentary) of Sahih Muslim'* explains (these words) in the following way; Arba'oo, with the wasali hamza and a fatha on the singular baa, means give oneself peace and lower the voice for one only raises one's voice when one is addressing someone afar. Otherwise it is Mustahab to keep the voice lowered. Of course when there is the need one should raise the voice but a lowered voice is more respectful. If need arises one can raise one's voice.

Imam Abu Dawud in the chapter *'Al Istigfaar'* of *'Book of Salaah'* narrates from Musa bin Ismail who was told by Hammaad, from Thaabit, Ali bin Zaid, and Saeed bin Jurairi who were told by Abu Uthman who said that Abu Musa stated

'I was on a journey with the Prophet and as we approached Madeenah people proclaimed takbeer in a raised voice. The Prophet said 'O people! You are not addressing a deaf or absent, Verily the One you are calling is between you and the heads of your horses. He then said 'O Abu Musa shall I not tell you of a treasure from the treasures of Paradise'.

(In a second narration) Mussadad heard from Yazeed bin Zurae from Sulayman Taymi from Abu Uthman from Abu Musa *'They were with the Prophet ascending from a valley and one person whenever he ascended from a valley...'* The remainder is as the hadith in Muslim.

Abu Salih states that Abu Isaac Fazaari said from Asim from Abu Uthman who narrates a hadith similar to the one in Muslim with the words *'Oh people keep yourselves at peace'*.

Imam Bukhaari in the chapter *'The distastefulness of raising the voice in Takbeer'* narrates from Muhammad bin Yusuf from Sufyan from Asim from Abu Uthman from Abu Musa Al Ashari who said

'We were with the Prophet and when we would ascend upon a mountain we would proclaim Takbeer and Tahleel in a loud voice. The Prophet said 'Oh people keep yourselves at peace ...' The rest of the narration is as in Muslim.

Imam Qastalaani in Irshaad-us-Saari (Shara Bukhaari) writes

'Imam Tibree has stated that in this the Kiraaha (dislike) of Dhikr and Dua in a raised voice is proven, this is also the statement of the whole Aslaaf, Sahaaba and Taabi'een'.

Ibn Majah and Nisai also narrate this hadith.

This hadith proves that the Prophet expressed his dislike for Dhikr in a loud voice. If Dhikr Jahr is not haraam it must (at least) be Makruh.

The answer to this objection is in two ways:

1) The commandment contained in the word 'Arba'oo' is not waajib – so it (cannot) render Jahr Haraam or Makruh - rather the basis of this commandment is ease and comfort. Consequently Shaykh Muhaddith ul Delhvi in Al Lumaat Shar'ul Mishkaat states 'Arbaoo' indicates that the order to

refrain from Jahr was for comfort and convenience, not because Jahr was contrary to Shariah’.

Consequently this hadith only proves that quiet Dhikr is Mustahab, and in this there is no disagreement. Imam Muslim also alludes to this in his naming of chapters of his Sahih (e.g. to keep the voice low in Dhikr is Mustahab) and so does Allaama Nawawi in his Shar’ of it.

2) Their Jahr (which the Prophet prohibited) was excessive, just as some narrations prove. (For example) it is stated in Fath ul Wudood, the Shara of Sunan Abu Dawud

“the words ‘they raised their voices’ prove that they were excessive in Jahr. Thus this narration cannot be used to prohibit all types of Jahr”

(In addition) Whilst explaining the Hadith *‘If he remembers Me in a group...’* Mulla Ali Qaari in *‘Hirz ut Thameen Shara Al Hisn ul Hiseen’* writes

‘It is possible that this alludes to quiet Dhikr, just as the following hadith also alludes ‘Performing the Dhikr of Allah amongst the ignorant is like being patient and steadfast on the battlefield whilst others flee. It is also possible that the meaning of ‘with a group’ proves the permissibility of Jahr that is not excessive, because the Prophet said to some companions when they raised their voices excessively ‘Give yourselves peace’.

(The author is demonstrating that even Mulla Ali Qaari sees this hadith as prohibiting excessive Jahr, not all Jahr)

3) A third way to answer this is that if the Prophet had not stopped them and allowed them to continue, they would

necessarily have inferred that it was sunnah to perform Dhikr in a raised voice when on a journey or ascending from a valley. This is because just as a Sunnah can be established by *Qowl* (statement) and *Fail* (action) it can also be established by *Taqreer* (remaining silent upon an action). Because this was not what was desired the Prophet stopped them for the convenience of his Ummah. Thus this hadith does not prove an absolute prohibition of Dhikr Jahr, as is evident to the reader.

And as for the claim that this proves that Dhikr Jahr can be prohibited if it is expedient or prudent, because (here) the Prophet was in the course of a Jihad, and there was a real danger that the Kuffaar may hear the raised Dhikr and put the Muslims in peril. This proves that war is strategic, just as Bazaari has mentioned. This claim is not correct because as you know from many narrations this event occurred on the way back from battle.

Yes, Allaama Baghvi in '*Muaalim At Tanzeel*' does narrate that this occurred on the way to battle. He states

“Ahmad bin Abdullah related to us from Muhammad bin Yusuf from Ismail from Abd ul Waahid from Asim from Abu Uthman from Abu Musa who said ‘At the time of the Battle of Khaybar, and the Prophet was heading towards Khaybar, some people ascended from a valley and raised their voice in Takbeer ‘Allah u Akbar, Allah u Akbar, Laa illaaha illallah. The Prophet said ‘Give yourselves peace’.

This hadith gives rise to the opinion that this event occurred on the way to Khaybar, but the majority of Sahih narrations prove that this happened on the way back close to Madeenah Tayyiba. This is my research and Allah best knows the true events.

Objection No. 3

Allah states (in Surah Asraa v110) 'And offer your Salah neither aloud nor in a low voice, but follow a way between.'

There are several answers to this.

1) This verse does not prohibit Dhikr Jahr absolutely, it only prohibits excessive Jahr, for Allah has stated '*but follow a way between.*' Thus this verse is evidence for the advocates of Jahr and not for those against!

2) This verse was revealed whilst the Prophet was in Makkah preaching in secret. When the Prophet would recite aloud the Mushrikeen would hear it and swear at both the Quran and He who revealed it. Thus Allah forbade Jahr and said '*And offer your Salah neither aloud nor in a low voice, but follow a way between*' i.e. He asked the Prophet not to recite aloud in Prayer to prevent the Mushrikeen hearing it and swearing at it. The words '*Nor in a low voice, but follow a way between*' mean that recitation should not be very loud nor very silent but between the two. This is as Bukhaari (in Kitaab ut Tafseer of this verse) and Tirmidhi have narrated from Ibn Abbas, which Tirmidhi ranks as Hassan Sahih:

'This prohibition was due to the villainy and swearing of the Mushrikeen, when this problem was no more the restriction too lapsed'.

A similar case is the commandment '*Do not swear at them (the false deities and idols) which they worship instead of Allah for they may be excessive and swear, without knowledge, at Allah*' (Surah Anaam v108).

Allah prohibited the swearing at false idols and deities for they (the mushrikeen) may in response swear at Allah, now this fear has diminished so too has the prohibition. Ibn Kathir has also indicated towards this in his tafseer.

3) The third response is that this verse was revealed about the Dua in Tashahud just as Tibri, Ibn Khuzayma and Haakim have narrated from Hazrat Aisha. Thus it does not prove the prohibition of all types of Dhikr Jahr.

A question often posed is that from the narration of Bukhari it cannot be said that Hazrat Aisha claimed the verse '*Perform not Jahr in Qiraat*' was about Dua (in Tashaahud). (In addition) Ibn Mardwiya narrates from Abu Hurayra

“When the Prophet would pray next to the house he would raise his voice in dua and then this verse was revealed.”

Thus both narrations do not state that this verse is specifically for the dua of Tashahud and so the prohibition of all Dhikr Jahr comes to be known from this verse.

In reply we state that if for the sake of argument we accept this verse prohibits all types of Jahr (excessive or modest), it is still only about dua and not about all types of Dhikr. Dua is a special type of Dhikr, in which silence is afdhal (better) because it is closer to acceptance, except where there is a need (for Dua to be Jahr). As stated in Bazaariya

‘there is no issue if a preacher performs dua aloud for the purpose of spreading knowledge and if the people perform it loudly with him’.

Thus when Allah tells the story of Zakkariya to our Prophet He says '*When he called out to his Lord a call in secret*' (Surah

Maryam verse 3) For this reason Istiaaza (A'oozu billahi) in prayer is recited quietly for it is a Dua. The aim of this discussion is to prove the impermissibility of Jahr in all types of Dhikr and this piece of evidence does not prove that.

Objection No. 4

Allah says (Surah A'raaf v55) 'Invoke your Lord with humility and in secret. He likes not the aggressors'.

Zaid bin Aslam has taken I'tada (aggression) to mean Dhikr Jahr from the saying of Ibn Abi Haatim. Both Ibn Jareer and Abu'l Shaykh narrate the same from Ibn Jurayh.

The answer to this is in two forms:

1) We have just stated that Dua is a specific form of Dhikr and consequently rules pertaining to it do not necessarily apply to other forms of Dhikr. Evidence prohibiting Jahr in Dua cannot be used to prohibit all types of Dhikr Jahr.

2) The term I'tada has been explained in many other ways: Ibn Abi Haatim narrates from Saeed bin Jabeer that Allah's proclamation 'He likes not the aggressors' means that people should not make an evil Dua for (other) believers for it is (a form of) enmity. Similarly Ibn Jareer and Ibn Abi Haatim copy Abu Mijlaz's meaning that people should not ask for the rank of Prophethood.

The most accepted explanation of Itidaa (aggression/excess) is the one alluded to by Imam Suyooti (*in Nateeja-tul-Fikr*) and others:

The meaning of Al I'tida is to exceed the command and it is to ask for something which has no basis in Shariah.

This is proven by that narrated by Ibn Abi Shayba, Abd bin Humaid, Abu Dawud, Ibn Majah, Ibn Habbaan, Imam Haakim and Bayhaqi from Abdullah bin Mugaffal that he heard his son supplicating 'Oh Allah I ask that as I enter paradise there be for me a white palace on the right hand side of paradise'.

(Abdullah bin Mugaffal) said 'O my son, (only) ask Allah for Paradise and seek protection from hell, for I have heard the Prophet say 'There will be some in this Ummah who will exceed the limits in their Duas and Tahaarah (cleanliness)'.

Ta'yaalisi, Ibn Abi Shayba, Ahmad, Abu Dawud, Ibn Manzar, Ibn Abi Haatim, Abu Shaykh and Ibn Mardwiya narrate from Saad bin Abi Waqaas that

'He heard his son's Dua 'Oh Allah I ask from You Paradise, its delights and its silk garments, and I seek shelter from Hell, and its chains. On hearing this he said 'Verily you have asked for a lot of good (khair Kathir) and sought shelter from a lot of evil (Shar Kathir) and I have heard the Prophet say 'There will be some people from this nation who will be excessive in the Duas and then he recited the verse 'He likes not the aggressors', and it would be better if you say 'Oh Allah I ask you for Paradise and the deeds and words which will bring me closer to Paradise. I seek shelter with you from Hell and those words and actions which will take me closer to hell.'

Thus according to this widely accepted explanation this verse does not form part of our discussion (because it relates only to Dua).

Objection No. 5

Ibn Masud threw out from the Mosque people performing Dhikr in a raised voice stating 'I find you nothing but (performers of) Bidhat' (i.e. he considered those performing Dhikr Jahr innovators).

There are several answers to this claim.

1) Although this Athar (statement of a Companion) is mentioned in the books of many of the Fuqaha it is not found in any of the books of Hadith. In fact, (we find) the opposite (permissibility of Dhikr Jahr) is proven from Ibn Masud (evidence supporting Dhikr Jahr is found from Ibn Masud).

Imam Suyooti in *Nateeja-tul-Fikr* states that this Athar of Ibn Masud is in need of a Sanad (chain of narration) and (we also need to know) which of the Huffaaz of Hadith have mentioned this in their books. (Because) I have seen (narrations) which necessitate the opposite to be attributed to Ibn Masud, for example that which Imam Ahmad in *Kitaab-uz-Zuhd* narrates from Hussain bin Muhammad who related with his narration from Abu Waail

'Those people are slanderous who claim that Ibn Masud used to prevent Dhikr Jahr, I never sat with Abdullah (ibn Masud) except that he was performing the Dhikr (Jahr) of Allah.'

2) Even if we do accept this Athar it still contradicts many other Sahih and Sareeh (clear) Ahadith in which in excess Dhikr Jahr is proven. Consequently these latter ahadith are given priority (i.e. when a statement of a companion contradicts an authentic Hadith of the Prophet the Hadith of the Prophet is given priority).

3) The third reply is as the one given by Bazaari in his Fatwa and this has already been mentioned.

Objection No.6

Bayhaqi in 'Shob-ul-Imaan'; Ibn Habaan and Imam Ahmad in his 'Musnad' narrate, with a Sahih chain, Saad bin Maalik's statement '*The best Dhikr is light (quiet) and the best Rizq is that which suffices*'

This hadith proves that Dhikr Jahr is bad and a bad must either be Haraam or Makruh.

The answer to claim is that it does not prove the prohibition of Dhikr Jahr, it only proves that quiet Dhikr is afdhal (better), about which there is no controversy. This response is based on the fact that according to the Musanifeen and Imams of language there are two usage's of the word Khair

- The first usage is to indicate Tafdeel (being good) and not Afdaleeat (being the best). In the former instance its opposite will be Shar (bad).
- The second usage is to indicate Afdaleeat (being the best), its original was Akhyar and for eloquence the hamza was dropped.

(For example) regarding the Hadith '*My life is Khair for you and my death is Khair for you*' Imam Suyooti was asked how either one could be better than the other? Imam Suyooti replied

'There are two meanings to Khair. In this hadith the Khair is used in the first context mentioned above, of being Tafdeel, and not afdal. Thus it means that both the Prophets life and death are both good.'

After understanding this (the two meanings of Khair) we assert that the Khair used in the hadith 'Dhikr Khafi is khair' is in the context of Afdhal - it means that there is more khair in silent dhikr and in Jahr there is lesser khair. It certainly does not mean that Jahr is evil as the opponents understand.

SECTION THREE

Summary

There is no doubt that quiet Dhikr is better than Dhikr Jahr for it is more humble. Similarly there is little doubt that excessive Jahr is forbidden because of the hadith '*give yourselves peace*'.

And as for in excessive Jahr the Ahadith are categorically clear and the Aathaar concur on its permissibility. We find no clear proof of it being haraam or disliked. Indeed the statements of the Muhadditheen, the Shafa'ee Fuqaha and some of our (Hanafee) Fuqaha also illustrate its permissibility. The statement of the author of 'Nihaaya' in Kitaab -ul- Hajj is also proof

'For us quiet Dhikr is Mustahab except when the purpose is an announcement, such as the Adhaan; Talbiya (at Hajj) and Khutba (sermon).'

It is clear that those who claim Jahr is haraam mean excessive Jahr. The proof of this is that they base their claim on the hadith '*Give yourselves peace*'. You know the reason for this hadith, it was for excessive Jahr and not all Jahr. In addition how can the illegality of something be proven from a Khabr-ul-Waahid that is (based on) Zanni proof.

And those who claim that Dhikr Jahr is bid'ah mean only that its performance in a specific way and its reckoning to be necessary like the other necessities of religion is not determined by Shariah. The proof of this is that they have only used the term bid'ah for the raised takbeer in the path to the Eid ul Fitr prayer. They state that raised takbeer in this specific way is only mentioned for Eid ul Adha and performing takbeer in the same way on Eid ul Fitr is bid'ah. You need to fully concentrate here to understand the real point for many

people here have lost their footing. Many, at this stage, have even become dumbfounded! One should not be hasty in accepting and refuting for this is the way of the Masses.

Conclusion

Alongwith Quiet Dhikr and Jahr Dhikr there is another type of Dhikr, the *Qalbee Dhikr* (of the heart). Some fuqaha have completely rejected it claiming it is non-existent.

In truth, such a comment is based upon arrogance. For verily Dhikr is the opposite of *Nisyaan* (forgetfulness) and both are in fact actions (matters) of the heart and not the tongue. Yes, there are specific signs and known commandments for Dhikr *Lisaani* (of the tongue) which do not exist for Dhikr Qalbee, (but) this assymetry does not mean that Dhikr Qalbee is not a type of Dhikr. Just as Shaykh (Abdul Haque Muhaddith) Dehlvi mentions in his risaala '*Tanbee Ahl ul Dhikr, Baraayati Adaab Al Dhikr*'

'It is stated in 'Al Hirz At Thameem', the Shar of Hisn Hiseen, in explanation of the Hadith 'Whoever remembered me in his self I remember him in My Self'. 'In it is proof that Dhikr Qalbee is the best, then the quiet Dhikr of the tongue. This is because it is stated that not even the angels can hear it and its reward is seventy-fold greater. And it is stated 'The best Dhikr is quiet Dhikr'.

And as for the statement of the author of 'Hisn Hiseen':

'All prescribed Dhikr, whether Waajib or Mustahab, is not reliable and accountable until oneself can hear it'

the commentator states that this rule is for those Adhkaar (pl.Dhikr) which Shariah has ordered to be recited by the

tongue, such as the recitation of Salaah, Tashahud and its Tasbeehs. It does not mean that Dhikr performed only in the heart, without words on the tongue is unacceptable in Shariah, because without it perpetual Dhikr cannot even be imagined. Verily (Dhikr of heart) is the best type of Dhikr.

The Muhaddith Abu Ya'laa Al Mowsilee in his Musnad narrates the statement of Aisha radhiyallahu 'anha

'The best Dhikr is Quiet which (even) the angels do not hear. The angels will be asked on the day of Judgement 'Look, has this person any thing (deeds) more?' The Angels will reply 'There is nothing which we have known and memorised except which we have presented and recorded' Allah will say to his servant 'I have a deed of yours about which even you are unaware and I will reward you for it. It (the deed) is quiet Dhikr.'

Imam Suyooti has also mentioned this in '*Al Budoor As Saafira fi Ahwaal il Akhirah*'.

It is stated in 'Jaame':

'The best Dhikr is quiet and the best Rizq is what suffices'.

This has been narrated by Imam Ahmad, Ibn Habaan and Bayhaqi.

After Dhikr Qalbee is Dhikr Nafsee. Dhikr Nafsee is the uttering of Laa illaha illallaah or similar with each breath. This is beautiful Dhikr through which one attains similarity with the Angels.

In discussing Allah's statement '*They glorify His praises night and day, (and) they never slacken*' (Surah Anbiyaa v20) the Muhaddith Abu'l Shaykh narrates Imam Hassan's statement

“Allah proclaims ‘I turn for them their (very) breathing into Tasbeeh’

Shaykh Ibn Munzar; Ibn Abi Khaatim; Bayhaqi in ‘Shob al Imaan’ and Abu'l Shaykh narrate that Abdullah bin Haarith narrated

‘I asked Hazrat Ka'b ‘What do you understand from Allah's statement ‘They never slacken (Surah Anbiyaa v20)’, because surely they must be busy spreading the Message of Allah or fulfilling their needs’ Ka'b replied ‘Allah has made their Tasbeeh like he has your breathing for you’. Do you not breath whilst eating, drinking, standing, sitting, walking and talking?! Their Tasbeeh has been made similar (to your breathing), they perform Tasbeeh night and day and never slacken’.

This hadith is the (beautiful) foundation (proof) of Dhikr Nafsee and is a great narration. Remember it! It is the gift and bounty of the time.